

This Project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This report reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein

Final Meeting ADLAB project VRT Headquarters, Brussels 19th September 2014 PROCEEDINGS

# **Christopher Taylor**

Introduction



AUDIO DESCRIPTION: LIFELONG ACCESS FOR THE BLIND is the name of the project undertaken by the following partners as part of the EACEA Lifelong Learning programme.

- University of Trieste
- Autonomous University of Barcelona (UAB)
- **O** University of Leiria (IPL)
- **O** University of Antwerp
- **O** University of Poznan (UAM)
- BayerischerRundfunk
- **O** VRT (Belgian state television)
- Senza Barriere

The project was launched in October 2011 and ended in September 2014 with the Final Meeting held in Brussels before an audience of stakeholders from the member countries and the project officer from EACEA.

The members were all chosen on the basis of their already proven expertise in audiovisual translation on either the academic front or the professional side, in some cases both. They brought to the project the following languages – English, Italian, Spanish, Catalan, Portuguese, Flemish, Polish and German and, given their individual provenance, represented a diverse array of audiovisual translation techniques – dubbing, subtitling, voiceover, subtitling for the deaf and hard of hearing and, crucially, audio description for the blind and partially sighted (AD). It was also of the utmost important that "specific relevance to enterprise-industry cooperation will need to be borne out by the project's practical activities." For this reason the inclusion of 'Senza Barriere', a service provider of AD to the Italian blind and sight-impaired community, Bayerischer Rundfunk, a major German broadcaster with consolidated experience of AD, and Vlaamse Radio en Televisie (VRT), the Belgian national television channel, was essential.

The project 'road map' was envisaged in terms of eight work packages (WPs), the coordination of which was assigned individually to the various partners. Apart from the WPs devoted to dissemination and management issues, the main 'deliverables' consisted in (1) the producing of a 'photograph' of the current situation in Europe regarding the blind and sight-impaired communities and the extent of knowledge and implementation of AD, (2) a report and subsequently published volume based on highly detailed text analyses, (3) a report on the testing phase in which differing AD versions were tested on blind and sight-impaired end-users of AD, and (4) the creation of a manual consisting of innovative strategic guidelines for use in the profession and in courses in higher education institutions (HEI), available in the form of an e-book. The results of the work carried out would then be disseminated in a variety of ways to identified stakeholders in academia and, particularly, in the AD profession among service providers, media figures and political decision-makers. Exploitation of the results would then follow in the form of course curricula being introduced in HEI and best practices in the industry. Furthermore the project would end officially in September 2014 but would be sustained thereafter by a process of gathering momentum consisting of continuing presentation at seminars and congresses throughout Europe, expansion of courses in HEI, the adoption of ADLAB-produced material (reports, books and manual) among stakeholders, and research into exciting new areas such as AD on smartphones and tablets.

Thus the initial aims and objectives of ADLAB were to create authoritative guidelines for the AD profession in all Europe based on in-depth text analysis and testing of selected material, to disseminate the results as widely as possible and to develop curricula for HEI in Europe. This would lead to the effective formation and training of audio describers (and audio describer trainers). But hand in hand with these aims was the need to sensitise and influence decision-makers at a local, national and European level and create useful connections with the industry and with the service providers. Last but not least was the overriding aim of creating social inclusion via AD, thereby improving the lives of the blind and visually impaired population, also reaching out to newly arrived immigrants, those with learning difficulties, language learners and any other group who could benefit from an audio described product. In this sense, as one of the results of the first work

package showed, reaching the blind communities who are not aware of AD and showing the benefits both to the blind themselves and to others was an important step.

The research carried out was focused largely on the audio description of film, given that that medium, especially in its television and DVD variants, is by far the most requested area on the part of the blind and sight-impaired population. However, other areas such as theatre, art galleries, museums, tourist sites, exhibitions and live events were given due consideration.

The various work packages will be described in detail in these proceedings by their individual coordinators.

WP1 was coordinated by Bernd Benecke and Haide Voelz of Bayerischer Rubdfunk.

WP2 was coordinated by Pilar Orero, Anna Matamala and Anna Maszerowska of UAB.

WP3 was coordinated by Iwona Mazur and Agnieszka Chmiel of UAM.

WP4 was coordinated by Aline Remael, Nina Reviers and Gert Vercauteren of the Universitiy of Antwerp. The production of the e-book was organized by Manuela Francisco of IPL.

What follows is a short overview by the project leader, Christopher Taylor.

Thus, following WP1 and the snapshot of the situation regarding the blind and sight-impaired population in Europe, which answered the questions:

How many blind and sight-impaired people are there in the various European countries?

Is the number increasing or decreasing?

How much awareness of audio description exists?

What is the current provision of AD?

attention turned to the Text Analysis phase (WP2) which concentrated on the flagship text, the film *Inglourious Basterds* by Quentin Tarantino. Very briefly, a master matrix of potentially difficult aspects of AD, ranging from characterisation to text-on-screen to intertextuality to gesture.... was created on the basis of the detailed analyses carried out by all the partners. This provided the material for the text analysis report which was then expanded and divided into chapters for the book *Audio Description: new perspectives illustrated* published by Benjamins.

This was followed by the testing phase (WP3) where the impact on the end-users, i.e. the blind and sight-impaired community, was investigated. Again based on material from the text *Inglourious Basterds* (film clips and questionnaires) a comparison of descriptive and narrative approaches measuring levels of comprehension and enjoyment was made.

Finally, as mentioned above, a manual of what is hoped will be seen as authoritative guidelines was produced, based on all the previous work and on new ideas emanating from all partners in the creation of a coherent and innovative document containing all the important aspects and 'crisis points' identified in the audio describing process. A decision was made at an early stage, taking into

consideration all that had been learnt *en route*, to formulate 'strategic' guidelines for the manual. These are now available in the form of an e-book on the project website <u>www.adlabproject.eu</u>.

The formal presentations of the Final Meeting were followed by a general discussion on a range of issues involving a number of invited stakeholders and ADLAB members.

The issues raised included:

- 1) the usefulness of audio introductions and whether they should enhance or replace an audio description;
- 2) the importance of knowing the AD audience;
- 3) the need for an international forum to confront ideas on how best to provide AD. ADLAB could point interested parties in the right direction through the virtual work environment;
- 4) how to reach out to many older people who are 'invisible' and do not appear on mailing lists, etc. but who are avid television 'watchers'. The role of the blind associations would be crucial in this respect;
- 5) how to promote AD through political channels and how difficult this is in times of crisis;
- 6) the importance of involving blind and sight-impaired persons in the AD process. ADLAB has encouraged this and the service-provider members all involve blind collaborators;
- 7) the realization that companies, broadcasters, film distributors, etc. are much more interested in money than in quality. Taylor describes a meeting held in Rome to sensitise politicians and film companies, who basically snubbed the event;
- 8) the inclusion of AD in DVD packages (trailers, interviews with actors, subtitled versions, missing scenes, etc.) in order to cut costs. Experience in Australia would support this strategy. And Remael insists that the provision of AD impacts only very slightly on the overall cost of movie production;
- 9) discussion of new technologies such as those for supplying AD on smartphones and tablets, and consequently the expansion of AD availability in cinemas. Two representatives of Culturabile, responsible for this research, participate in the debate;
- 10) the use of artificial voices. The quality is constantly improving and is sufficient for some productions but the overall view is that the 'text to voice' technology still lacks the necessary empathy required in more sophisticated cases.
- 11) questions of copyright. In Poland the describer is paid copyright. Busarello of Senza Barriere points out that their work is limited by copyright considerations.

As the official life of ADLAB expires, these proceedings chart the progression of the project from beginning to end and it is the hope of all the members, who have worked consistently hard and well in every phase, that its results will prove useful to the world of audio description, now and in the future, as interest in AD and developments in the field expand.

# Work Package 1: The snapshot

# Bernd Benecke, Bayerischer Rundfunk (partner 6)

The aim of WP1 was to get an overview of the state of the art of Audio Description (AD) in the participating countries of the project. All data for each country was collected by the partners and put together by the German partner Bayerischer Rundfunk, namely researcher Haide Völz. Detailed information is available on the adlabproject.eu homepage, this here is to highlight some of the major outcomes.

As this was a snapshot taken in early 2012, some updates – where available - were made, especially regarding the situation in Germany, where major changes occurred in the field of TV and cinema.

This snapshot analyses the main cultural areas of everyday life: TV, DVD or BluRay, Cinema, Museums and Theatre/Opera/Ballet.

Looking at **Television**, there are some communalities in the participating countries (no special equipment needed to receive AD, mainly public broadcasters provide AD) but some important differences that also have an influence on the description itself: Germany, Italy and Spain mostly dub films in foreign languages, Portugal and Flanders mostly use subtitles and Poland uses voiceover.

Germany has provided AD on TV for the longest period of time (starting in 1993) and through a large number of public broadcasters. AD is made available mainly for fiction films and series (e.g. the Sunday crime cult "Tatort") and some documentaries. Following some important changes in Germany's TV-fee regulations (people with disabilities including blind and visually impaired people now have to pay) the public ARD network offers on a voluntary basis AD for every fiction film and documentary at prime time on the premium channel "Das Erste" which leads to a quota of 44,2 per cent of AD at prime time and 9,7 per cent on a 24 hour basis. BR itself (which is one of the ARD partners) offers on its own channel 13,2 per cent AD at prime time, including Germany's only daily soap with AD.

Italy offered in 2012 more than 70 hours of AD every week, mainly old feature films and reruns of TV dramas and series. Sometimes the reception of AD was difficult, as the description was presented through Radio or Internet and users had to synchronise this signal with their TV set.

In Spain AD has a fairly long history and a wide distribution, starting in 1995 and leading to a total of 880 hours of AD in 2010, mainly provided by public channels.

In Portugal only one public broadcaster offers AD on free-to-air television, mostly Portuguese classics; the AD is received parallel to the TV signal via Radio.

A public broadcaster in Poland offers weekly 2-3 episodes of a Polish TV series and Polish films. These films and series are also available online with AD, which was unique in 2012. Now we find this service also in other partner countries, e.g. in the "Mediatheken" of Germany's public TV.

Flanders, the Dutch-speaking region of Belgium, started AD in 2012 with the aim of producing one popular crime series a year with AD, which is now reality. In addition public broadcaster VRT bought and broadcast existing programmes.

In the field of **DVD and BluRay** there were only a few published with AD in 2012 – the exception was Germany where 130 DVDs were already on the market, in 2014 this number went up to 183. DVDs are mostly fiction with a few exceptions (e.g. a documentary on the 2006 football world cup). Normally not only is the film described, but the DVD has also spoken information that starts when putting in the DVD and leads directly to the described version of the film. Three DVDs even offer a full accessible spoken menu; in one case the whole bonus material is described too.

In Spain and Italy two different initiatives produce AD –not for the public market but only on special copies for the blind and visually impaired: Spain's blind organisation ONCE already produced in 1987 the first AD on VHS tapes and sent these only to their members, but without asking the film companies for the copyright to do this. In Italy the ADLAB partner Senza Barriere Onlus produced 388 titles with AD until December 2011, in 2014 the number went up to around 600. The AD is distributed on a hire basis on audio CDs. The numbers of commercial DVDs/BluRays in the other partner countries were in 2012: Spain 33, Poland 21, Flanders 13, Italy 3 and Portugal 3. These figures have since increased, though not dramatically.

Concerning AD in **cinemas** there is still no cinema in any of the participating countries that offer AD on a regular basis. The closest to this aim are Spain and the Dutch speaking regions of Europe: Flanders and the Netherlands. Although Germany is far from this aim, a new regulation forces every film company that takes public funding (which includes almost every German film and also some international films shot in Germany like "The Reader", "Inglourious Basterds" or "Grand Budapest Hotel") to offer the film in cinemas with subtitles for the deaf and hard of hearing and AD. This is done but because of the missing AD equipment in the cinemas almost nobody can enjoy this. The only chance to date is to use an app for smartphones (Greta), that synchronises the downloaded AD with the sound coming from the speakers in the theatre. But for financial reasons the app is offering only a few titles. In Spain we find Cine Accessible that has provided monthly AD screenings in various cinemas since 2007 and an initiative of ADLAB partner UAB that offers films with open AD on a regular basis. Culturabile in Italy and the R.N.I.B in the UK are now experimenting with AD on smartphones and tablets for use in the cinema.

For **museums** we find in all participating countries only special guided audio tours for the blind and visually impaired. Whereas a small country like Belgium offers 16 museums with AD, there was in 2012 almost no big museum in the much bigger country of Germany that has exhibitions with AD. The situation has not changed much till now; although sometimes there are special exhibitions that have an AD service, but still not on a regular basis. For the other countries we have 25 museums of all kinds in Spain with permanent AD offers and also 2 museums in Portugal and 3 in Poland where the permanent exhibitions are described.

The final section in this chapter in on AD for **Theatre/Opera and Ballet**. In all participating countries we find one-off AD performances from time to time, but the number of these events differ: In Spain 8 theatres present regular AD for their theatre plays, in Germany there is one opera with regular AD and some theatres with 1-2 AD events per year. Flanders has 1 theatre offering

regular AD with 2 more in the planning stage. Italy specialises in opera performances, offered in 3 venues regularly and Portugal is the country with AD for modern dance performances.

Summing up the information given in this chapter we can say that AD in ADLAB countries is mainly provided for films on TV, sometimes on DVD/BluRay or in cinema. Fields of audio-visual art like museums, theatre or opera are still very weak when it comes to AD and should be treated more seriously. On the other hand a regular offer of AD on TV as an everyday medium seems more important than AD for "events" like cinema, museum or theatre taking into account that being blind or visually impaired leads mainly to a lack of mobility.

# Work Package 2: The ADLAB book: the origins and the results

# Anna Matamala, Pilar Orero (partner 2)

One of the key outputs of the ADLAB project has been the book *Audio Description. New Perspectives Illustrated*, co-edited by Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona partners Anna Maszerowska, Anna Matamala, and Pilar Orero, and published by Benjamins at Benjamins Translation Library (number 112).

This short paper addresses the rationale behind the book, which is the result of Work Package 2 of the ADLAB project ("Text analysis and development"), and it then presents a brief summary of its content.

# 1. Analysing "Inglourious Basterds": methodological approach

The aim of the book was to present the findings from the ADLAB project regarding the analysis of audio descriptions and the possible strategies to be employed when drafting a script, which correspond to Work Package 2.

The methodological approach in WP2 was subject to multiple discussions among the project partners. Various proposals were put forward, such as using established theoretical approaches to analyse the *who*, *what*, *when* and *where* (seminal aspects of any filmic narrative) or constituting a corpus from different genres or different films. However, it was finally decided to adopt a bottom-up methodology using a single input. This meant that all partners worked on a single film without any pre-conceived categories. The rationale behind the selection of this single item was therefore crucial, and the reasons for selecting Quentin Tarantino's film *Inglourious Basterds* (2009) were manifold:

- a) combination of languages: the film's main language is English but German, French and Italian are also spoken. Subtitles in English or characters acting as interpreters allow the audience to understand these languages. Multilingualism, a significant feature of more and more films, was considered an interesting element when selecting the film.
- b) cultural references and intertextuality: *Inglourious Basterds* presents an extraordinary array of cultural references, which was expected to be a challenging aspect in the audio description process. There are also many references to historical characters and intertextual references. Capturing the many layers of information and prioritising them in a cohesive audio description was expected to be of the essence.
- c) gestural references: one of the critical scenes in the film is related to a hand gesture, but many others appear throughout the film. Various audiences in different countries may or may not be familiar with each of the gestures shown on screen, therefore suggesting differing audio description strategies.

- d) inclusion of many genres: according to von Dassanowsky (2012), the film encompasses many film genres from Western to James Bond while echoing most film directors. As Srinivasan (2012:1) points out, "[i]f there is any filmmaker whose single film could evoke comparisons ranging from *Happy Gilmore* (1996) to *La Dolce Vita* (1960) it would have to be Quentin Tarantino".
- e) provocation of emotions: as with many Tarantino's films, *Inglourious Basterds* produces a strong visual impact in the audience, and transmitting such an emotionally strong story using only the soundtrack and the audio description was considered challenging.
- f) editing issues: the film contains many shot changes and camera movements, as well as the black and white footage of a film within the film.
- g) sound intertextuality: this includes the music (with and without lyrics), which offers a rich array of references and effects in the film and has a direct impact on audio description, along with the sound effects and the overpowering silence.
- h) levels of interpretation and symbolism within the same narrative, and a vast array of examples of written language display on screen, and its impact on reception.

All partners watched the film, using the same copy with time codes burnt in to facilitate the analysis since each film software has a different time frame for reproduction. Using the same copy was also important since different versions, using various audiovisual translation modes (voice-over, subtitling, dubbing), have been commercialised in the project partners' countries.

After various thorough screenings by all project partners, an initial list of key issues was created using an excel table, and this was converted into an "initial matrix" by the Barcelona team. This matrix was then circulated to the member countries for comments, addition of categories, etc., which led to the forming of a final master matrix table containing all the key elements raised by the partners. The final "crisis points" or seminal issues were the following:

- **Text-on-screen**: these include the audio description of logos, opening and closing credits, titles, inserts, intertitles, maps, subtitles, among other elements.
- **Gestures and facial expressions:** there are a myriad of examples such as the "bravo" or "salute" gestures. Facial expressions are extremely meaningful when the French farmer sees German officers approaching their house; Shoshana's facial expression is also especially revealing when she realises she is talking to the man who killed her family, to give just two examples.
- **Spatio-temporal characteristics:** the action of the film happens at different times of the day and seasons, and there are sudden scene changes. Specially challenging are off-screen characters who need to be placed in the filmic space.

- **Music and sounds**: music and its opposite (silence) are considered under this category. Some examples include the sound of LaPadite smoking a pipe or the Basterds pealing the skulls.
- **Intertextual relations/cultural references**: historical characters (Churchill), Nazi symbols or the Cinderella intertextual relation when Landa puts the shoe on Von Hammersmark's foot are just some of the various examples found in the film.
- Secondary elements/content prioritisation issues: there are apparently minor issues which contribute to the film experience such as the person painting Hitler in the background in one of the scenes or the funny sleeping cap and pyjamas of a vet.
- **Characters:** identifying the character is a key issue, as well as deciding when to name it and how to describe it. Other challenges that the film presents are complex scenes with a lot of characters.
- **Cinema tools/camera techniques:** the film contains a wealth of cinema techniques: fadeouts, slow motion, close-ups, films within films, camera pedding, flashbacks, parallel shots, etc.
- Audio description wording, language and style: reaching a dialogue-AD coherence is a challenging issue, next other aspects such as language changes or the presence of original language, to name just a few.

A compressed version of the matrix, extracted from the WP2 deliverable, is included in Annex 1. Specific examples related to scenes in the film are listed for each category.

Once the list of categories was created, this was translated into an initial table of contents or book chapters. To guarantee the book homogeneity, a sample layout was created. The initial idea was to depart from a very specific sequence or example illustrating the issue under study, and then analyse each specific AD issue focusing on the previous example. It was then suggested to provide examples of AD in each partner's language, analyse the AD strategies used, and propose future research avenues related to the topic.

When implementing this initial layout into a specific topic, some problems emerged and the layout was adapted. It was decided that all contributors would focus on English, and the following structure was proposed: an introduction including specific examples from the film, a section on the state of the art (guidelines and research), a section on possible audio description strategies, and conclusions. Although this structure was advised to all contributors, the editors were also fully aware of the specificities of each topic, hence suggesting that any needed adaptations would be welcome. The final result was a book with a cohesive methodological approach but with sufficient flexibility to allow each author to express his/her views and adapt the structure to the topic under analysis.

# 2. The book

The book includes an introduction by Anna Maszerowska, Anna Matamala, Pilar Orero, and Nina Reviers (*From source text to target text: the art of audio description*), which contextualizes the book within the ADLAB project and gives a general overview of audio description in Europe.

The following ten chapters deal with key issues in audio description, namely:

- *Audiontroductions*, by Louise Fryer and Pablo Romero-Fresco. Although not initially included in the list of challenging issues, this was considered a good way to involve external researchers, add a relevant item, and provide in a much more meaningful way a film synopsis while discussing research and practical issues.
- *Intertextuality*, by Christopher Taylor.
- *Textual cohesion*, by Christopher Taylor: these two chapters are tightly related and delve into the film structure and how the various modes contribute to make meaning in the film narrative in a cohesive way. Intertextual references are also a crucial aspect that impact on the audio description
- *Spatio-temporal settings*, by Gert Vercauteren and Aline Remael: this chapter literally corresponds to one of the seminal aspects derived from the analysis and deals with the issue of translating visual spatial and temporal settings into words.
- *Film language and tools*, by Elisa Perego: as already pointed out before, the film under analysis presents a wealth of editing techniques and this chapter presents a clear categorisation and discusses possible strategies to deal with them.
- *Audio describing text on screen*, by Anna Matamala: this chapter classifies the various types of text on screen found in the film and proposes specific strategies depending on the contextual situation.
- *The importance of sound for audio description*, by Agnieszka Szarkowska and Pilar Orero: the many representations and functions of sound in the movie are the object of research in this chapter. Although audio description seems to be focusing on the visuals, the function of sound and the interaction of the audio description with the sound track and the quality of the sound mixing itself are key elements highlighted in this contribution.
- *Character fixation and character description: the naming and describing of characters in* Inglorious Basterds, by Bernd Benecek: this chapter proposes a Diagram of Fixation to help in the decision-making process, specifically concerning the naming and describing of characters.

- *Strategies for dealing with cultural references in audio description*, by Anna Maszerowska and Carme Mangiron: understanding cultural references are essential in order to understand the plot, and how to convey them in the audio description is the topic of this chapter. Examples range from military emblems to body language and religious icons.
- *Gestures and facial expressions in audio description*, by Iwona Mazur: this contribution analyses facial expressions and gestures associated with emotions, which allows the author to discuss the dichotomy between formally-oriented and dynamically-oriented audio descriptions.
- Secondary elements in audio description, by Pilar Orero and Anna Vilaró: adopting a different approach, this chapter presents an analysis of some examples of secondary elements using an eye-tracker.

# 3. Conclusions

All in all, this short contribution has summarised how the Work Package 2 analysis was carried out and how this was translated into a book. The book reflects an international research effort and goes beyond the analysis, offering new insights into the topic of audio description and opening many new research horizons. To conclude this brief article on the book, we would like to copy literally the words found on the book cover, which transmit its essence.

"Audio description (AD) is a narrative technique which provides complementary information regarding the where, who, what and how of any audiovisual content. It translates the visuals into words. The principal function of this ad hoc narrative is to make audiovisual content available to all: be it a guided city tour of Barcelona, a 3D film, or a Picasso painting. Audio description is one of the younger siblings of Audiovisual Translation, and it is epigonic to the audiovisual translation modality chosen. This book is the first volume on the topic written in English and it brings together an international team of leading audio description teachers, scholars, and practitioners to address the basic issues regarding audio description strategies. Using one stimulus, Quentin Tarantino's film Inglourious Basterds (2009), the authors analysed what, when, where and how to audio describe. The book is written in a collaborative effort, following a bottom up approach. The many issues that surfaced in the process of the analysis were grouped in broader categories represented in the ten chapters this book contains. A good example of a successful international collaboration, the volume sets a robust practical and theoretical framework for the many studies on audio description to come in the future. Considering the structure of the individual contributions, the book is not only oriented towards the identification of the challenges that await the describer, but it also offers an insight into their possible solutions."

# Bibliography

Maszerowska, Anna, Anna Matamala, and Pilar Orero. 2014. *Audio description: new perspectives illustrated*. Amsterdam: Benjamins.

Srinivasan, Sirkanth. 2012. "The Grand Illusion". In *Quentin Tarantino's Inglourious Basterds*, ed. By Robert von Dassanowsky, 1-15. London: Continuum.

Von Dassanowsky, Robert (ed.) 2012b. *Quentin Tarantino's Inglourious Basterds*. London: Continuum.

# Inglourious Basterds - Bottom-up Analysis

Secondary elements/content prioritisation issues

Landa drinking LaPadite's milk as if it was wine
 The size of Landa's pipe compared to the one LaPadite

• Aldo's scar on the neck • Close ups of the strudel and the whipped cream • The gun hidden in the Basterd's glove • Scene at the bar with the bartender eavesdropping the

Francesca's dog sitting at the restaurant table
 The bartender reaching for his riffle behind the bar while he pretends to read a poetry book
 Von Hammersmark's shoes revealed under the table as

The person painting Hitler in the background

she is talking to the Basterds in the restaurant The vet's funny sleeping hat and his pyjama
 Shoshana entering the room where Marcel is in a sexy

cinema-like style • Landa's notebook and writing utensils

ma tools/Camera techniques

Fade outs
 Slow motion
 Dissolutions
 Close ups
 Film within film (the projection of Zoller's film at the

Screen divided into two parts (one in colour, the other in

Subjective plans
 Colour (e.g., Shoshanna's red dress at the final screen-

Camera looking from upstairs/bird's eve perspective

Shoshanna's face going down in flames on the cinema

· Camera going down to reveal the Jews beneath the

Camera going down to reveal the dynamite hidden in the pants of the two Basterds

Parallel shots
 Shots "from behind the back"
 Camera viewpoint to reveal the eyes of the Jews in LaPadite's house peeking through the floor

Camera viewpoint corresponding to the character's view-

Audio description wording, language and style

Language changes
 The bad Italian accent revealing the cover of the

Names of bars, restaurants, cinemas, films

Leaving out parts of dialogue in the original language

conversation between the soldiers

has

cinema)

Lighting

ing)

Screen divided into two black and white)
The camera zooming in

· Sharp scene cuts

screen like a ghost

floor in LaPadite's house

Flashbacks

Wide shots Very brightly lit objects

Parallel shots

Filming from below
 Off-screen narrator

point

Camera moving around in a circle

Fast camera focus point changes Changes in camera focus

Dialogue-description coherence
 Image-AD coherence
 Appraisals

Comparisons
 Violence, brutality, love scenes

Anaphoric references

Subtitles

Basterds

#### Gestures and facial expressions

The "bravo" gesture Landa makes
 Landa shaking the hand of LaPadite

- Landa kissing the hand of one of LaPadite's daughters
- Landa touching the hand of LaPadite's wife to stop her
   LaPadite extending his arm to show where he is hiding
- Landa pointing with his finger on the areas beneath the
- floor where the Jews are The "salute" gesture
- Landa shaking his head to say "more or less"
   The Nazi to be killed in the woods putting his hand on the heart as if to swear something
   The "Heil Hitler" gesture

- Hugo Stiglitz's nodding with the head
   The Italian annoyance gesture (with the fingers)
   Hico's and Stiglitz's exchange of unhappy facial expressions and gestures with the fingers as if they were smell-
- ing something The face of LaPadite as the Nazis are approaching his
- The face of LaPadite's daughter as Landa is kissing her
- hand The face of LaPadite as he has to say whether he is
- sheltering Jews in his house or not
- Shoshanna's surprising look on her face as she learns how many Jews Zoller killed
   Shoshanna's face as she realizes who Landa is

- Shoshanna crying after Landa leaves the restaurant
   No clear emotion on the face of the Nazi soldier as the
- Basterds are about to kill him in the woods The long exchange of glances between Shoshanna and
- Landa in the restaurant
- Landa's face as he is examining the shoe left after the
- Shootout at the restaurant
   Stiglitz's angry face as he is remembering the tortures he experienced from the Nazis
- Bridget's face when she realizes that her shoe is in Lan-
- da's pocket
- ua s pocket Landa saying "bingo" and smilling like a child Shoshana's "forced smile" when she is hearing Goeb-bels joking with Zoller at the restaurant Goebels "ladylike" handshake with Shoshana

- . The concern on the face of the Jewish girl hiding be-
- Intertextual relations/cultural references
   Shoshan standing by the window in the cinema waiting
   Characters with historical background (e.g., C
- for the premiere
- Sho ana's face as she is with Zoller in the cafeteria
- Landa putting his finger to his mouth in a "hush" gesture
   Landa looking at LaPadite's daughters; the looks on
   their faces as he is examining the house

#### Characters

- Character/speaker identification Characters in a dialogue: how to announce the ex-
- change of looks/speech sequences?
- Naming of characters
   A character identified so far by his/her appearance is
   now called his/her name
   The same character in different settings at once
- Anticipation
- Off-screen/obscured characters
- · Complex scenes with a lot of characters
- Spatio-temporal characteristics
- Sudden scene changes
- Off-screen characters to be placed in the filmic space (e.g., the scene at the bar when the Nazi soldier is talking to Aldo who is still upstairs)
- Times of the day/seasons
- Ambientation

### Music and sounds

- Music in Inglourious Basterds
- Describing silences LaPadite cutting wood with an axe
- The SS car approaching LaPadite's house
   LaPadite washing his face
   Pouring milk into the glass
   LaPadite smoking his pipe
   LaPadite thereine

- Inhaling the pipe
- Pealing the skulls
   The baseball bat hitting on the walls
- Sniffing tobacco
   Text-on-screen accompanying sounds (e.g, Hugo
- Stiglitz's caption) Various manners of killing by Stiglitz
- Letters falling down as Shoshanna is changing the
- cinema posters
- The sound accompanying Shoshanna's name caption The sound accompanying Goebbels's name caption
- Zoller knocking on the window as Shoshanna is reading in the cafe
- Goebbels and Francesca's sex sce
- Lighting the cigarette Goebbels hitting Zoller with the napkin
- Shoshana's steps as she is escaping LaPadite's house/her hard breathing and crying
   The sounds of eating, smoking and drinking
   Stiglitz sharpening the blade
- Aldo putting his finger into the wound in Bridget's leg The ringing of the bell at the cinema to announce the
- change of roll Sounds of explosions/shooting
- The Nazis slashing Stiglitz with a whip
- The trigger of the gun being pulled
- Aldo hitting Landa on the forehead with his head
   Hellstrom hitting Stiglitz on the arm as if to "wake him
- up" Landa placing his hands on the table in a definitive ges-
- ture to end the war Killing a Nazi in the same jail Stiglitz is as the Basterds
- Come to pick him up (more of a background sound)
   Musical theme used when Zoller is leaving Shoshana as
  they met for the first time

- Characters with historical background (e.g., Churchill) Aldo's accent
- One of the Nazi soldier's belly dance (Mata Hari) during
- card game Shoshana painting her face red like a warrior and the lyrics of the song playing in the background saying "See
- these eyes so red" Cinderella intertextual relation (as Landa puts the shoe
- Onderena interfectual relation (as banda puts the shoe on Hanna's foot and it fits)
  When Donny is killing the Nazi with the bat and shouting
- victory afterwards
- The "3" gesture stika symbol reappearing along the film

#### Text on screen

- · Logos: "Universal Picture", "The Weinstein Company"
- Opening credits
- Closing credits Title
- Inserts/intertitles
- . The "Inglourious Basterds" inscription on the riffle

. The napkin Bridget von Hammersmark signed and

An arrow pointing at Martin Bormann together with the caption of his name

An arrow pointing at Hermann Goering together with the

- Names captioned

kissed

caption of his name Subtitles

Maps
 Maps
 Newspaper clippings
 Cinema lettering
 Shoshanna's passport
 The cards used in the card game

# Work Package 3: Testing

## Iwona Mazur and Agnieszka Chmiel (partner 5)

In Work Package 3 (Testing) partners conducted extensive testing using blind and visually impaired audiences and concerning problematic AD issues identified in WP2. In the study the opening scene from *Inglourious Basterds* (with two alternative ADs) was shown to a group of VIPs (divided into groups A and B), which was followed by a questionnaire-based interview. For the purposes of comparison, the same clip (without AD) was shown to a control group of sighted respondents, also followed by a questionnaire.

Each partner was asked to conduct the study on around 12 VIPs and a control group of approximately 12 sighted respondents. All in all, there were 80 visually-impaired participants and 77 sighted controls.

The tested issues included the opening credits (naming actors with protagonists, AD authors), text-on-screen, naming characters, film terminology and film technique (lighting, camera movement, shots), information sequencing and fragmentation, gestures, describing sounds, intertextual references, explicitation, narration vs. description. Because of time constraints, in the presentation results for three AD issues were reported on: gestures, filmic language and intertextual references.

As for gestures, in the experimental video, when Landa asks LaPadite about the ages of the Jewish children, LaPadite has problems remembering. Landa looks at him and moves his head and hand in a "more-or-less" gesture. AD-A included gesture description, AD-B included gesture meaning. The respondents were asked to repeat the gesture. 12% of group A respondents and 30% of group B respondents could show the gesture correctly. The gesture was shown correctly by only 7% of congenitally blind respondents exposed to gesture description. None of the congenitally blind respondents exposed to AD with the gesture named could show it. Among the non-congenitally blind viewers the correct score was 15% for group A and 42% for group B. This shows that this group of VIPs can use their verbal memory and assign a gesture to its meaning, as compared to congenitally blind viewers (which is less true the other way round, i.e. the meaning of the gesture could not be easily interpreted from its description). The follow-up question for group A only was about the meaning of the gesture. 20% of respondents interpreted the meaning correctly on the basis of the description, the majority of them were non-congenitally blind viewers. The correct score in this group was 38% as compared to just 7% among the congenitally blind. These results seem to suggest that gesture naming is a better solution from a communicative point of view, at least when given time constraints that do not allow for an exhaustive description of the gesture. Surprisingly, the correct score for the control group asked about the meaning of the gesture was 50%. The result may be low due to memory limitations or lapses of concentration.

When it comes to filmic language, in one of the sequences in the clip the camera shows just the boots and this is what AD-A describes ("His black boots walk towards the door"). AD-B ("He walks to the door") gives information about the character moving towards the door without reflecting the camerawork (the color of the boots is given earlier in the AD). We then asked the respondents about the color of Landa's boots. The percentage of correct answers was 44% for group A and 16% for group B (to compare, the overall correct score for the control group was 63%). When broken down by type of blindness, the data show the following pattern: 57% for congenitally blind respondents in group A and 18% in group B, 23% for non-congenitally blind respondents in group B.

And finally, the experimental video includes one very interesting intertextual reference. Landa's pipe resembles that of Sherlock Holmes. The descriptions of the pipe in the two ADs were manipulated so that AD-A included a conventional description without the intertextual reference ("an enormous, saxophone shaped pipe") while AD-B included the reference ("Sherlock-Holmes-Style Calabash). The respondents were to judge on a 5-point scale (1 – definitely not, 5 – definitely yes) to what extent the description helped them imagine the actual pipe. The scores were: 4.1 for group A and 2.1 for group B, which shows that the conventional description was much better received. In general, both groups preferred the traditional description (79% in group A and 62% in group B) over the intertextual one (9% in group A and 24% in group B). However, it is difficult to say if the intertextual description was less preferred because it referred to Sherlock Holmes or because it included a rather infrequent word "calabash", which was new to many respondents. Interestingly, only 13% of the control group respondents associated Landa's pipe with the one smoked by Sherlock Holmes, which shows that in this case the reference may have been too obscure and as such need not be included in AD to achieve the equivalent effect.

In conclusion, WP3 has identified troublesome aspects of AD and has highlighted the need to adopt individual strategies instead of general across-the-board guidelines. As in any other type of translation, individual solutions are decided upon in a given context that should be carefully considered by the decision-maker, i.e. the audio describer. At the same time, although the project had many strengths, the researchers were aware of some weaknesses of the study, which may have introduced certain confounding variables.

# Work package 4: *The Manual* FROM GUIDELINES TO STRATEGIES – FROM PROBLEMS TO SOLUTIONS

# Aline Remael, Nina Reviers, Gert Vercauteren (partner 4)

# Introduction

Guidelines on how to write AD scripts are not new. However, current guidelines are based on practice rather than research and therefore tend to reflect the views and experience of the practitioners who write them, or their (national) audiovisual translation traditions. Having said that, even such "traditional" guidelines agree on a number of issues concerning the writing of AD scripts for film and television. Since the core target group of AD is constituted of blind and visually impaired persons (VIP's), any guideline's main aim is to make the audiovisual product it describes accessible to this rather heterogeneous group.

Traditional guidelines therefore agree on what information should be covered in AD, that is:

- WHAT is happening on screen?
- WHEN is the action taking place?
- WHERE is the action taking place?
- WHO is involved in the action?

Problems arise when audiodescribers need to fine-tune any of these four items. In other words, traditional guidelines remain vague about:

- what exactly and how much to describe or how to determine what is important,
- when and how to describe or how to fit the AD into the film to create a coherent target text,
- how to handle interpretation in the transition from a visual to a verbal text,
- how the AD scriptwriting phase fits into the overall AD production process.

All of these items are of major importance for the describer. Everyone knows that "a picture paints a thousand words": images present information simultaneously, whereas words present information in a linear manner. Consequently, a verbal narrative, like AD, can never include all of the information that is presented through the visual mode of the film on screen. Describers need strategies to help them decide what must be included in their descriptions and what can be left out in a given context. In addition, the AD, traditional guidelines state, should never interfere with dialogues or important music and sound effects since these information channels are important in film, and already accessible to the target audience. What the guidelines do not clarify sufficiently is how to solve this problem in very talkative scenes that leave no room for any AD to be inserted into the sound track without disrupting its other components. Another issue that is also related to the transition from the visual to the verbal mode and therefore at the core of AD, is that "naming"

always involves interpretation. This leads to the unresolved issue of how, for instance, describers should handle the verbal rendering of visually displayed emotions without allowing their personal background or subjectivity to colour the description. Indeed, traditional guidelines also stipulate that describers must strive to be as objective as possible. But how objective is objective enough and also feasible? Finally, audio describers do not work in isolation, they are part of a team and must be aware of the roles fulfilled by the other specialists on the team, e.g. the technicians in the recording studio. However, traditional guidelines pay little or no attention to the role of the other team members beyond mentioning them. The schematic representation below provides a basic overview of this AD process for recorded AD:



# **Translation Studies to the rescue**

AD is studied from the perspective of different disciplines (such as Film Studies, Psychology, Linguistics). Our perspective is that of (Audiovisual) Translation Studies. Any form of translation is a decision-making process and any form of translation involves a degree of contextualized interpretation. Awareness of such production conditions and the role they play in the entire translation process, help translators elect the appropriate translation strategy in a given context.

It was our hypothesis at the start of the ADLAB project that this is no different for AD. The project therefore resorted to a functionalist Translation Studies approach to devise audio description strategies that would allow describers to take their own concerted and contextualized decisions during the AD scriptwriting process. Indeed, functional TS distinguishes a number of translation stages that can easily be transferred to the AD process. The major ones are:

• source text (ST) analysis: determine what story the film tells and how,

- target public analysis: be aware of the needs and expectations of the audience,
- determination of best translation and hence description strategies: combine contextualized macro level and micro level insights into the ST and into the envisaged TT and its context,
- creation of the TT: use information assembled in the previous steps and include target audience feedback if questions remain. In other words, consulting one or more VIP's is always a good option.

This approach constituted the basis for our development of the *ADLAB audio description strategies*. The variables involved in AD are too numerous for straightforward prescriptive guidelines to work in different filmic contexts. Audio describers need to be able to make decisions and distinguish between different AD options when they are describing a TV series, film or other audiovisual product.

# Audio description strategies in e-book form

The primary aim of the strategies developed by the ADLAB project for its e-book, based on insights from TS is therefore to allow the describers to determine the variables in their ST and TT and to supply them with strategies for handling these variables. Its secondary aim is to provide the reader-describers with information about the place of the AD scriptwriting phase in the entire AD production process, provide information about the input of other actors in this production chain, including information about the functioning of related text forms that are sometimes used in conjunction with AD (audio introductions and audio subtitles), to inform about AD variants for other contexts (the performing arts and museums), to provide further reading and an alphabetical glossary for targeted searches.

The e-book is a very flexible format and it will be fully accessible. Its target readers are: AD trainers (universities & companies), (independent) audio description students, professional audio describers, stakeholders and anyone with an interest in accessible media.

# The e-book structure in greater detail

The book will consist of four main sections, further subdivided into chapters. The first section, the "introduction", has five chapters.

- 1.1.What is audio-description: A definition
- 1.2. Overview of the process from start to end
- 1.3. What is a story and how is a story told
- 1.4. Audio-description: From visual to verbal narration

1.5.How to use these guidelines

These introductory chapters contain information that the readers will need when they tackle the section on AD scriptwriting, irrespective of whether they wish to read all the chapters consecutively or just consult a chapter on a specific sub-topic.

The core of the book, in other words, "AD scriptwriting", the section dealing with the strategies for writing the AD script, consists of three main chapters, further subdivided into sub-chapters as indicated below.

- 2.1 Narratological building blocks:
- 2.1.1 Characters & action
- 2.1.2 Spatio-temporal settings
- 2.1.3 Genre
- 2.2 Film techniques
- 2.2.1 Film language
- 2.2.2 Sound effects and music
- 2.2.3 Text on screen
- 2.2.4 Intertextual references
- 2.3 The language of AD
- 2.3.1 Wording & Style
- 2.3.2 Cohesion

Thirdly, "Information on the AD process and its variants", the section that offers additional information about peripheral text forms that are sometimes used in conjunction with AD, other types of AD as well as information of a more technical nature, has four main chapters.

3.1 Technical issues

- 3.2 Audio Introductions
- 3.3 Combining AD with audio-subtitling
- 3.4 Introduction to other forms of AD:
- 3.4.1 Audio describing theatre performances
- 3.4.2 Descriptive guides

The first chapter from this section will make the describer aware of the need for collaboration with the other members on the production team and goes into some (national) variants in the production process. Audio introductions explain the use of a very specific text that is best known from AD for the theatre: the theatre presents very specific challenges to the describer, one is the often symbolic nature of its settings and another the abundance of dialogue in some plays. Audio introductions are used to supply information to the target audience that cannot be provided during the performance, before the play starts. Audio-subtitling takes care of translation issues in productions in a language that is not the language of the target audience or in multilingual productions. Audio-subtitles are an aural form of the better-known written subtitles that usually appear at the bottom of the film or TV screen, and translate the film dialogues or monologues. To conclude, the last two subchapters of section 3 provide some basic information about the challenges facing describers working in museums or in the theatre.

The very last section of the book, the "appendices", contains an example of an AD script, and an example of an audio-introduction, as well as additional hints for descriptive museum guides, a glossary and suggestions for further reading.

# Structure of the core chapters: an example

In order to facilitate navigation, all the chapters in the core section of the book, "AD scriptwriting", have been given the same structure. They start with a definition of their specific sub-topic, proceed to giving strategies for ST analysis, which are followed by strategies for TT production and rounded off with concrete examples of alternative strategies.

The chapter devoted to the description of characters, for instance, starts with the following definition:

Characters and their actions and reactions are an essential part of a film narrative, moving the story forward. Characters have a physical body, but they also have traits, such as skills, attitudes, habits or tastes. If a character has only a few traits, then they are said to be one-dimensional, if they have many traits (sometimes contradictory ones), they are three-dimensional. In film, traits of characters are usually revealed quickly and in a straightforward manner.

Then, a checklist is provided that will help determine the describers what types of characters they are faced with in a given film or even in a given scene. The items that are discussed and explained with a view to their relevance for AD are:

General Issues

How do we get to know characters in film?

How do other narrative building blocks contribute (e.g. chapter on settings)?

Checklist

Narrative link with other characters Narrative link with time/settings From focal character to supporting character New – known – altered Authentic or fictional Real or unrealistic/fantasy Functional and/or symbolic

In the next stage, TT creation, the describers will be advised to determine their strategies for the description of a character, i.e. they will be able to decide what to describe and how, on the basis of the concrete manifestation of (some) of the items from the checklist in their film, and the more general information about the functioning of AD given in the introduction of the book. One result might be: the character is focal, has a lot of narrative weight and enters into direct relations with at least one other character, her husband. She is a protagonist and must receive considerable attention in the AD. The audience gets to know her in conjunction with a very specific setting (Richmond, England in the 1930s), which is an important structuring factor in the film, since this takes place in three locations, each connected to a specific time. In fact, the character enters into symbolic relations with two other women protagonists, who inhabit the other two space-time frames of the film. The AD will have to make this symbolic connection clear. Moreover, the character is a 'real' historical English character, which means that some (national) target audiences

may know her, whereas others may not, etc. These data in conjunction with the describers' awareness of the technical AD constraints and awareness of their target audience will help them determine their AD strategies.

Very concretely, alternatives for introducing the character, depending, for instance, on whether the audience can be expected to know the historical character or not, but also on the space available, are:

- Virginia Woolf (name the character)
- the English writer Virginia Woolf (give a gloss + name the character)
- a middle-aged woman with a slightly hooked nose and hair pulled back in a bun (describe the character)
- a middle-aged woman with a slightly hooked nose and hair pulled back in a bun, Virginia Wolf (describe and name the character)

# **Concluding thoughts**

The example shows that hard and fast rules do not work for AD. There are simply too many variables at play and these must be reassessed for each film, even for each scene. The ADLAB AD strategies offer describers the tools to do just that: teach and help audio describers to determine what is important, decide what and how much to describe and when. This means that, as in the case of translations, two AD's, written by two different audio describers, will never be exactly the same but films and genres too are in constant flux, audiences are never the same, nor are (national) contexts. Flexible and adaptable ADLAB strategies are therefore the only solution.

# Work Package 4a ADLAB Guidelines and web dissemination: eBook and MOOC

# Sandro Costa Claudio Esperanca, Manuela Francisco, Joselia Neves (partner 3)

Currently the web is one of the most privileged channels for the dissemination of work, projects and research and sharing knowledge in various fields. This is relevant if we consider that, according to the Internet Live Stats, more than 40% of the world's population uses the Internet, of which about 20% are Europeans. The relevance that the web has in the present day is highlighted by several authors (Duffy, 2000; Hansen & Haas, 2001), who, in addition to stressing that information technologies enable a more efficient dissemination of information and knowledge, suggest that the diversity of audiovisual/media formats are responsible for a more effective and comprehensive dissemination. Other authors, among whom Bernhardt, Mays & Kreuter (2011), add that the social networking and interactivity that emerged in the era of web 2.0 have created an unprecedented mass sharing space. Swan & Hall (2010) and Harnad et al. (2009) reinforce the potential of the web for the dissemination of knowledge, based on open-access. As referred by Sharple et al. (2013), MOOCs (Massive Online Open Course) comply with the spirit of open-access as a means to make knowledge accessible to all those interested. But, as the web founder Berners-Lee (1997) advocates, in order to be made available to all user profiles (W3C, 2012), it is crucial that the information provided on the web complies with the WCAG accessibility guidelines (W3C, 2008).

Taking all the above said, and particularly because we share the conviction that the web is an excellent vehicle for the dissemination of knowledge, we have created a model for an affordable eBook, to present the ADLAB (Audio Description: Lifelong Access for the Blind) guidelines, that takes into account the diversity of user profiles. This ebook was developed using Web technologies and formats, including HTML5, JavaScript and CSS3, according to accessibility guidelines proposed in the WCAG (Web Content Accessibility Guidelines) 2.0 and WAI-ARIA (Accessible Rich Internet Applications) 1.0. Given the fact that it is an open format, widely supported by various tools and devices, with great accessibility features, the decision to develop a web format seemed the most suitable for the proposed dissemination objectives in that they too promote accessibility and inclusion. Another reason for this decision is that this format can be easily indexed by search engines (such as GoogleBot or Bingbot) allowing anyone to easily find the content. In addition to paying particular attention to the structuring of content, through the choice of HTML elements suitable for the presentation of the information required, additional features in the ebook interface were also incorporated (i.e. manipulation of text and font size, change color schemes,...). These features will improve the user experience in that it allows users to tailor their interfaces to their preferences or needs. Responsive design mechanisms were also incorporated as deemed necessary, to ensure that the interface and content of the eBook are adjustable to the size of diverse screens and devices. The final products (ebook template and contents of the ADLAB guidelines) were tested with automatic validation tools (W3C validator suite and UMIC Access Monitor), and was submitted to expert validation by people with different user profiles (with and without disabilities) and using different assistive technologies. These validation procedures allowed us to detect and fix usability and accessibility problems in the ebook.

Given the importance of audio description as an accessibility technique to make media and audiovisual texts available to all, we thought it would be relevant to turn to new learning paradigms, namely the MOOCs, to make audio description better known, whilst disseminating the ADLAB guidelines (eBook) in the guise of a theoretical framework for the course. An introductory MOOC – "ADLAB initiation into audio description filmic" – was designed and made available in English and Portuguese, on the UP2U - Instituto Politécnico de Leiria open courses platform (http: up2u.ipleiria.pt).

This (free) open-access course is designed to take 3 weeks and is structured in 3 modules (one per week), presenting theoretical materials (excerpts from the ADLAB eBook) and practical activities, such as quizzes and video excerpts for the scripting of ADs. After the first course, the Leiria group will assess the course's relevance, its impact on the dissemination of the ADLAB project by quantifying the number of people and/or institutions reached through data analysis and decision support tools implemented in our specifically developed systems. In the event of positive results (more than 100 attendees) another two courses will be developed that can also be used to promote the courses of ADLAB partner universities.

In order to disseminate the ADLAB project we also created an online advertising campaign (Google AdWords) to publicize the MOOC and the ebook. This approach aims to achieve a greater number of users in the shortest time possible, thus completing the MOOC and eBook dissemination work package.

Keywords: adlab, audio description, guidelines, web dissemination, mooc, ebook, accessibility

# REFERENCES

Berners-Lee, T. (1997). Realising the Full Potential of the Web. *Based on a talk presented at the W3C meeting, London, 1997/12/3. Online.* Retrieved September 10, 2014, from http://www.w3.org/1998/02/Potential.html

Bernhardt, J.M., Mays, D. & Kreuter, M.W. (2011). Dissemination 2.0: closing the gap between knowledge and practice with new media and marketing. *Journal of Health Communication: International Perspectives*, Vol. 16 (1): 32-44.

Duffy, M. (2000). The Internet as a research and dissemination resource. *Health Promotion International*, Vol. 15 (4): 349-353

Hansen, M.T. & Haas, M. (2001). Competing for Attention in Knowledge Markets: Electronic Document Dissemination in a Management Consulting Company. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, Vol. 6: 1-28.

Harnad, S., Carr, L., Swan, A., Sale, A. & Bosc, H. (2009) Open Access repositories: maximizing and measuring research impact through university and research-funder. Open Access self-archiving mandates. Wissenschafts management 4, Juli/August: 36-41. Retrieved September 10, 2014, from <a href="http://eprints.ecs.soton.ac.uk/16616/">http://eprints.ecs.soton.ac.uk/16616/</a>

Sharples, M., McAndrew, P., Weller, M., Ferguson, R., FitzGerald, E., Hirst, T., & Gaved, M. (2013). Innovating Pedagogy 2013: Open University Innovation Report 2. Milton Keynes: The Open University, UK.

Swan, A. & Hall, M. (2010). Why Open Access can change science in the developing world. Public Service Review: International Development Online.

W3C. (2012, august 1). Diversity of Web Users. Abou-Zahra, S. (Ed.). *World Wide Web Consortium (W3C) Web site*. Retrieved September 10, 2014, from <u>http://www.w3.org/WAI/intro/people-use-web/diversity</u>

W3C. (2008, dezembro 11). Web Content Accessibility Guidelines (WCAG) 2.0. Caldwell, B., Cooper, M., Reid, L. G. & Vanderheiden, G. (Eds). *World Wide Web Consortium (W3C) Web site*. Retrieved September 10, 2014, from <u>http://www.w3.org/TR/WCAG20/</u>